

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



**HPRB ACTIONS**  
**April 23 and 30, 2015**

The Historic Preservation Review Board meet and considered the following items on April 23 and 30, 2015.

**APRIL 23 MEETING**

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor. Absent: Charles Wilson.

**AGENDA**

**DESIGNATION HEARINGS**

Corcoran Gallery of Art, 1700 New York Avenue/500 17<sup>th</sup> Street/1701 E Street NW, Case 13-01, amendment to designate portions of the interior. [*Board deliberation and decision only; no additional testimony will be taken*]

The Board amended the property's landmark designation in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites, designating portions of the interior as recommended by the HPO staff (not including the basement, the auditorium, six of the galleries, and some back-of-house spaces). The Board also requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the amendment to the National Register of Historic Places as information to supplement the previous nominations and listing of the property. Vote: 7-0.

West Heating Plant, 1051-1055 29<sup>th</sup> Street NW, Case 14-04.

The Board reaffirmed that the property contributes to the character of the Georgetown Historic District but denied the proposed landmark designation and did not request that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register. Vote: 4-3.

~~7 Grant Circle NW, Case 15-08.~~

This application was withdrawn and was not discussed at the hearing.

Emory United Methodist Church, 6100 (and 6104 and 6120) Georgia Avenue NW, Case 15-06.

The Board designated the Emory United Methodist Church property a historic landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites. The Board also requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 7-0.

**HISTORIC LANDMARK**

Emory United Methodist Church, 6100 Georgia Avenue NW, HPA 15-307, raze

The Board advised the Mayor's Agent that the proposed demolition is inconsistent with the purposes of the preservation law, because it does not retain a historic landmark property. Vote: 7-0.

Emory United Methodist Church, 6100 Georgia Avenue NW, concept/demolition and new construction. The Board supported further archaeological investigation of the property. The Board suggested revisions to the plans for new construction and to lessen the amount of demolition. Vote: 7-0.

#### **DESIGNATION HEARING**

Capitol Hill Historic District amendment/expansion, Case 15-01.

Consideration of the historic district amendment application was continued to the May 28 meeting, because there was insufficient time to take testimony.

### **APRIL 30 MEETING**

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor, Charles Wilson.

#### **AGENDA**

#### **HISTORIC LANDMARKS**

Stevens School, 1050 21<sup>st</sup> Street NW, HPA 15-219, concept/renovation, new construction.

The HPRB make the following findings: (1) the preservation was commended, and the redevelopment plans should fully incorporate the findings of that plan, including but not limited to historically appropriate replacement windows on the primary elevations, restoration of masonry, and a finish treatment that restores the building to its mid-20<sup>th</sup> century appearance; (2) the general height and mass of the new construction was found to be compatible with the landmark, but that the cantilevered element over the rear of the school should be eliminated, the screen wall at the top floor should be eliminated, and the alley between the school and office building should be made wider; (3) it was recommended to the Mayor's Agent that the lot consolidation subdivision is compatible with the character of the landmark. The project should return for further review when appropriate. Vote: 6-0 (Ally recused, Wilson absent).

McMillan Sand Filtration Site, 2501 1<sup>st</sup> Street NW, HPA 15-090, revised concept/mixed use, multiple-dwelling building with ground-level retail on north service corridor.

The HPRB found the revised concept's height, massing, material palette, and detailing to be compatible with the previously-approved McMillan redevelopment master plan. The Board approved the reduced size of the bridge, but asked that it continue to be studied to relate more to the buildings it connects. Vote: 6-1.

#### **FOGGY BOTTOM HISTORIC DISTRICT**

2532 I Street NW, HPA 15-293, concept/three-story rear addition and roof deck.

The Board found the concept incompatible, unless the addition is reduced to two stories. A deck atop the addition may be compatible if redesigned (if it is set back sufficiently from the west edge of the building and has no visible stair penthouse). Vote: 5-2.

**HISTORIC LANDMARK**

Spring Valley Shopping Center, 4866 Massachusetts Avenue NW, HPA 15-283, concept/one-story front addition and renovation of front exterior space.

The HPRB found the concept for alterations and additions to the building to be incompatible as proposed, and recommended the proposal be modified as recommended in the staff report and return to the Board for review when appropriate. Vote: 8-0

Spring Valley Shopping Center, 4820 Massachusetts Avenue NW, HPA 15-252, concept/new construction of two-story retail and office building.

The HRPB found the general concept for a two-story building in this location to be compatible with the character of the landmark, but that the proposal should be revised as recommended in the staff report to more closely relate to the detailing and scale of the complex. In addition, the Board asked that the connection or transition with 4860 be eliminated or restudied. The project should return for final conceptual review when ready. Vote: 8-0

**U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT**

1504 Swann Street NW, HPA 15-128, rear addition and roof deck.

The Board found the concept for a rear addition to be compatible with the historic district in accordance with the staff report recommendations and the requirement to keep the existing side parapet and set in the addition slightly. Vote: 7-0 (Aurbach absent).

**SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT**

810 O Street, NW, HPA 15-248, concept/new construction of 9 story apartment building.

The HRPB approved the concept, with the revised one-story retail base, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 7-0.

**CONSENT CALENDAR****APRIL 23 MEETING**

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on April 23 by a vote of 7-0.

**HISTORIC LANDMARKS**

Plan of the City of Washington (L'Enfant Plan; L'Enfant-McMillan Plan) Proposed closing of 1<sup>st</sup> Street SW from R to T streets; R Street SW from Half to First Street; and S Street west of Half to Second Street; and portions of Potomac Avenue, S.O. 13-14605.

The Board unanimously adopted the staff report which recommended that: 1.) the street closures should be contingent upon development of the DC United stadium; 2.) the adverse effect resulting from closure should be mitigated through building and public space design that follows the principles of the L'Enfant Plan; 3.) further design of the project should be undertaken in consultation with the DC SHPO and other interested agencies and groups; and 4.) agreements should provide for the restoration of streets to their historic pattern if the stadium is removed. The HPRB also directed that the reservations be restored if the stadium is removed. The staff report was revised accordingly.

First Church of Christ, Scientist, 1780 Columbia Road NW, HPA 15-290 (formerly 1770 Euclid), subdivision.

**CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT**

527 6<sup>th</sup> Street SE, HPA 15-282, concept/rear addition and deck.

~~631 South Carolina Ave SE, HPA 15-305, concept/rear addition. (deferred at the request of the applicant)~~

432 New Jersey Ave SE, HPA 13-263, concept renewal/addition.

**CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT**

3610 Macomb Street NW, HPA 15-302, addition and front porch alterations. (Vote 6-0, Casarella recused)

**DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

1758 Church Street NW, HPA 15-247, third-story addition.

**DENIAL CALENDAR**

The Board approved the following item on the denial calendar on April 23 by a vote of 7-0.

**MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

1223 4<sup>th</sup> Street NW, HPA 15-296, permit/replace two front windows with triple-ganged windows.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

**APRIL 30 MEETING**

The Board approved the following item on the consent calendar on April 30 by a vote of 7-0 (Wilson absent).

**U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT**

1481 Florida Avenue, NW, HPA 15-244, revised concept/side addition

---

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, [www.olenderreporting.com](http://www.olenderreporting.com), or [info@OlenderReporting.com](mailto:info@OlenderReporting.com). Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>

---

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD  
MASTER PLAN REVIEW**

---

Property Address:	<b>2501 First Street, NW</b>	<b>X</b>	Agenda
Landmark/District:	<b>McMillan Reservoir</b>		Consent Calendar
Meeting Date:	<b>April 23 and 30, 2015</b>	<b>X</b>	Conceptual Review
Staff Reviewer:	<b>Steve Callcott</b>		Alteration
		<b>X</b>	New Construction
			Demolition

---

Jair Lynch Development Partners, with plans prepared by MV + A Architects, seeks on-going conceptual design review for a seven story mixed-use residential and retail building on Parcel 2 at the McMillan Reservoir sand filtration site. Parcel 2 is located on the south side of the north service court between the new north-south Half Street and First Street; it is segmented by Three-Quarter Street.

When reviewed in January, the Board concluded that the height, massing, architectural design and use of a road-spanning bridge element were not yet compatible with the landmark or the master plan, and asked that the design be refined and return for further review. Of specific concern was the street-spanning bridge element.

**Proposal**

As before, the project calls for a seven story building atop a two-story below-grade garage. The bridge element has been pulled further back from the north service court; previously it was set back approximately 20 feet from the edge of the north face of the masonry plinth, which has been increased to more than 40 feet. Apartment units have been removed from the north side of the bridge, which would now read as an angled glass corridor. The units have been retained on the south side, resulting in a bridge depth of approximately 33 feet.

The elevations have been revised, the detailing of the brick work and metal paneling has been refined, and the first floor storefronts have been reduced to smaller individual projections, rather than larger projections that spanned across the masonry piers.

**Evaluation**

As before, the project's height, general massing, color and materials palette are compatible with the master plan for the McMillan site. The façade revisions have resulted in greater symmetry and balance between the two building elements facing the north service court; with an increased number of balconies and higher proportion of masonry, they are also more interesting and residential in character. The simplification of the brickwork, which reads as thinner than the previous iteration, is less evocative of an historic building and provides a more subtle contrast with the metal skin that is used on the other portions of the building.

While the ideal scenario is for the bridge to be removed entirely, the increased setback, angled shape, and simplification to a sheer glass skin results in it being less of a prominent element of the composition and more effective in visually separating the masses on either side of the new Three-Quarter Street. The bridge would not be seen from most perspective views from the north service court, giving the impression of two separate buildings flanking the new road.

**Recommendation**

*The HPO recommends that the Board find the concept's height, massing, material palette, and detailing to be compatible with the previously-approved McMillan redevelopment master plan, and seeks the Board's direction on whether the reduced, redesigned bridge satisfies its previous concerns.*